A Tough Pill to Swallow: The Merger of Express Scripts and Medco

In early April 2012, the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) approved Express Scripts, Inc.’s acquisition of Medco Health Solutions, Inc. by a 3-1 vote, allowing for the creation of one of the largest pharmacy benefit management (PBM) companies in the United States. Originally announced in July 2011, the St. Louis, Missouri-based Express Scripts’ $29.1 billion acquisition of the New Jersey-based Medco purportedly increased Express Scripts’ customer base to more than 130 million, representing a 50 percent increase in its customer base. Unlike traditional brick-and-mortar pharmacies such as Walgreens and CVS, PBMs operate as middlemen between healthcare service payors (which are generally insurance companies) and employers and patients. As such, Express Scripts and other PBM companies typically leverage significant customer bases in their negotiations with pharmaceutical and drug manufacturers in order to transfer favorable rates to their customers. Due to the potential antitrust issues associated with the merger, Express Scripts’ newly expanded customer base has caused a debate among stakeholders in the pharmaceutical industry.

While many pharmaceutical industry participants touted the merger’s positive benefits, some trade representatives sought judicial recourse based partially on the elimination of competition resulting from Express Scripts’ and Medco’s purchase of retail pharmacies, claiming that the merger violated Section 7 of the Clayton Act. In the suit filed in the Western District of Pennsylvania on March 29th, the National Association of Chain Drug Stores (NACDS) and the National Community Pharmacists Association (NCPA) among others, claimed that the merger would create a “dominant entity” and would result in an anticompetitive influence over retail community pharmacy services, thereby leaving only “two significant competitors in a highly concentrated industry.” Cathy Bissoon, the U.S. District Judge presiding over the dispute, listened to three hours of oral arguments on April 10th, during which the plaintiffs asked the court to hold Medco’s assets and operations separate from those of Express Scripts until its emergency request is either granted or denied. To date, Judge Bissoon has yet to enter a final decision on this matter. Despite the uncertainty of this litigation, the FTC has since granted its permission for the merger to move forward.

After eight months of investigation, the FTC released a nine-page opinion on April 2, 2012, detailing its approval of the merger and noting that it was not an “easy decision.” FTC Commissioner Julie Brill disagreed with the commission’s final vote and issued a separate opinion, labeling the transaction as a “merger to duopoly” and cited to congressional intent under Section 7 of the Clayton Act. After the merger of the two largest PBMs, CVS Caremark is the sole remaining entity of what was previously referred to as the “Big Three” by Commissioner Brill. Despite Brill’s dissent, the FTC’s opinion notes that with at least ten significant competitors, the PBM industry is only moderately concentrated and will remain competitive after the proposed merger. In its review, the FTC scrutinized three aspects of the merger, including: (1) its potential anticompetitive effects to employers; (2) whether the merged company is likely to have monopsony power; and, (3) any potential anticompetitive effects with respect to specialty drugs. Ultimately, Chairman Jon Leibowitz and Commissioners J. Thomas Rosch and Edith Ramirez reasoned that, although the merger would result in higher market concentration, the market would still be highly competitive due to the remaining nine firms’ presence, and further remarked that the merged company poses little risk of utilizing monopsony power because the PBM market does not foster coordinated interaction.

Despite the FTC’s approval, however, the issue seems far from settled, as dozens of Congressional members and state attorneys general are still actively opposing the merger, with the NCPA set to report any anticompetitive conduct as soon as it is observed. Accordingly, the newly merged entity will be under close scrutiny as to whether it can deliver on its promised benefits.

3 “What is a ‘Pharmacy Benefit Manager’?” By Thomas Gryta, (Continued on next page)


10. Ibid.


12. Ibid., p. 2-7.

13. Ibid., p. 7.


Robert James Cimasi, MHA, ASA, FRICS, MCBA, AVA, CM&AA, serves as President of Health Capital Consultants (HCC), a nationally recognized healthcare financial and economic consulting firm headquartered in St. Louis, MO, serving clients in 49 states since 1993. Mr. Cimasi has over thirty years of experience in serving clients, with a professional focus on the financial and economic aspects of healthcare service sector entities including: valuation consulting and capital formation services; healthcare industry transactions including joint ventures, mergers, acquisitions, and divestitures; litigation support & expert testimony; and, certificate-of-need and other regulatory and policy planning consulting.

Mr. Cimasi holds a Masters in Health Administration from the University of Maryland, as well as several professional designations: Accredited Senior Appraiser (ASA – American Society of Appraisers); Fellow Royal Intuition of Chartered Surveyors (FRICS – Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors); Master Certified Business Appraiser (MCBA – Institute of Business Appraisers); Accredited Valuation Analyst (AVA – National Association of Certified Valuators and Analysts); and, Certified Merger & Acquisition Advisor (CM&AA – Alliance of Merger & Acquisition Advisors). He has served as an expert witness on cases in numerous courts, and has provided testimony before federal and state legislative committees. He is a nationally known speaker on healthcare industry topics, the author of several books, the latest of which include: “The U.S. Healthcare Certificate of Need Sourcebook” [2005 – Beard Books], “An Exciting Insight into the Healthcare Industry and Medical Practice Valuation” [2002 – AICPA], and “A Guide to Consulting Services for Emerging Healthcare Organizations” [1999 John Wiley and Sons].

Mr. Cimasi is the author of numerous additional chapters in anthologies, books, and legal treatises; published articles in peer reviewed and industry trade journals; research papers and case studies; and, is often quoted by healthcare industry press. In 2006, Mr. Cimasi was honored with the prestigious “Shannon Pratt Award in Business Valuation” conferred by the Institute of Business Appraisers. Mr. Cimasi serves on the Editorial Board of the Business Appraisals Practice of the Institute of Business Appraisers, of which he is a member of the College of Fellows.

Todd A. Zigrang, MBA, MHA, ASA, FACHE, is the Senior Vice President of Health Capital Consultants (HCC), where he focuses on the areas valuation and financial analysis for hospitals and other healthcare enterprises. Mr. Zigrang has significant physician integration and financial analysis experience, and has participated in the development of a physician-owned multi-specialty MSO and networks involving a wide range of specialities; physician-owned hospitals, as well as several limited liability companies for the purpose of acquiring acute care and specialty hospitals, ASCs and other ancillary facilities; participated in the evaluation and negotiation of managed care contracts, performed and assisted in the valuation of various healthcare entities and related litigation support engagements; created pro forma financials; written business plans; conducted a range of industry research; completed due diligence practice analysis; overseen the selection process for vendors, contractors, and architects; and, worked on the arrangement of financing. Mr. Zigrang holds a Master of Science in Health Administration and a Masters in Business Administration from the University of Missouri at Columbia, and is a Fellow of the American College of Healthcare Executives. He has co-authored “Research and Financial Benchmarking in the Healthcare Industry” (STP Financial Management) and “Healthcare Industry Research and its Application in Financial Consulting” (Aspen Publishers). He has additionally taught before the Institute of Business Appraisers and CPA Leadership Institute, and has presented healthcare industry valuation related research papers before the Healthcare Financial Management Association; the National CPA Health Care Adviser’s Association; Association for Corporate Growth; Infocast Executive Education Series; the St. Louis Business Valuation Roundtable; and, Physician Hospitals of America.

Anne P. Sharamitaro, Esq., is the Vice President of Health Capital Consultants (HCC), where she focuses on the areas of Certificate of Need (CON); regulatory compliance, managed care, and antitrust consulting. Ms. Sharamitaro is a member of the Missouri Bar and holds a J.D. and Health Law Certificate from Saint Louis University School of Law, where she served as an editor for the Journal of Health Law, published by the American Health Lawyers Association. She has presented healthcare industry related research papers before Physician Hospitals of America and the National Association of Certified Valuation Analysts and co-authored chapters in “Healthcare Organizations: Financial Management Strategies,” published in 2008.