

HEALTH CAPITAL

Volume 3, Issue 11

November 2010

Topics

Anne Sharamitato, Esq. - Vice President of Research • Cora Drew, JD - Editor

Physician Cost Profiling

Increasing quality of care and controlling costs constitute a major objective of the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act (ACA). Physician cost profiling, which refers to a system of rating individual physicians based on spending patterns, has emerged as a possible response to the ACA's cost control initiatives.¹ Each physician is assigned a single number, or cost profile, that places him or her on a relative scale of spending, generally broken down into high, average, or low classifications.² Cost profiles are calculated by determining: (1) the type of care to include in the profile; (2) the costs assigned to each unit of care; (3) the physician responsible for care; (4) peers to whom physicians should be compared; (5) the rubric for constructing the profiles; and, (6) the process for placing a physician in a low-cost or high-cost category.³ Purchasers can then use these cost profiles to determine high-cost physicians when making provider decisions.⁴ It is important to note, however, that physician cost profiling does not determine or address issues regarding physician competency, with licensing and credentialing entities overseeing these matters.⁵

Inherent in this new method of classification are issues related to the methodology, accuracy, and validity of the calculated rankings. The first issue stems from determining whether costs assigned to units of care should be issued according to each patient or by each episode of care.⁶ Additionally, issues arise when attempting to assign accountability for costs, as a patient's continuum of care often involves more than one physician.⁷ The reliability of the rankings and misclassification of physicians also raise concerns. In a recent study by RAND Health, analysts found that 22 percent of physicians were misclassified and 59 percent of physicians had profile scores with less than 70 percent reliability, which appear to indicate that the differences in scores did not actually reflect variations in physician spending.⁸ According to RAND, these substantial errors warrant delaying the use of physician cost profiling until these issues have been resolved.⁹

Although the debate persists as to whether any calculation method may provide an accurate rating of the relative costs of individual physicians, the cost-saving potential offered by profiling is attractive and is gaining momentum. Cost-profiling has been implemented in the ACA through Medicare, which will

provide physician profiles by 2012.¹⁰ Known as relative resource reports, the methodology of calculating these cost profiles has yet to be determined, but is part of the ACA's objective to lower the cost of Medicare claims.¹¹

Private insurers and employers also intend to implement use of physician cost profiles to incentivize beneficiaries to seek care from physicians with relatively lower spending patterns, by dividing physicians contracted within their health plan's network into tiers based on such factors as quality and cost.¹² For employees and other members of health plans utilizing this profiling method, patients may pay lower out-of-pocket charges if they visit physicians within the preferred ranking and higher out-of-pocket expenses for visiting physicians with a lower ranking.¹³ Some large employers have already implemented such tiered systems, and more are expected to do so as health care reform tightens government control of the insurance market.¹⁴

Generally, physicians have not responded favorably to physician cost profiling. In a letter addressed to 47 health plans around the country, the American Medical Association (AMA) and its partners stated that while they believe patient education about providers is important, inaccurate ratings from utilizing current methods of cost profiling will unnecessarily tarnish competent physicians' reputations and damage trusted physician-patient relationships.¹⁵ The letter cites numerous studies, including the study conducted by RAND, which illustrate the unreliability and inaccuracy of physician profiling.¹⁶ The AMA argues that these studies prove that using unscientific methods for creating tiered insurance plans is unadvisable.¹⁷ In concluding the letter, the AMA urged insurers to strongly reevaluate the systems through which they rate physicians and to demonstrate the systems' reliability and accuracy by scientific means before implementing them in their health plans.¹⁸

¹ "Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?" By RAND Corporation, RAND Health (2010), p. 1.

² "Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?" By RAND Corporation, RAND Health (2010), p. 1.

³ "Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?" By RAND Corporation, RAND Health (2010), p. 2.

⁴ "Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?" By RAND Corporation, RAND Health (2010), p. 1.

⁵ "Physician Profiling, Guiding Principles," By American Academy of Family Physicians, (2007),

(Continued from previous page)

- 6 www.aafp.org/online/en/home/policy/policies/p/physicianprofiling.html, (Accessed 10/20/10).
- 7 “Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?” By RAND Corporation, RAND Health (2010), p. 2.
- 8 “Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?” By RAND Corporation, RAND Health (2010), p. 2.
- 9 “Physician Cost Profiling – Reliability and Risk of Misclassification” By John L. Adams, et al., The New England Journal of Medicine, Vol. 362, No. 11 (march 18, 2010), p.1014.
- 10 “Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?” By RAND Corporation, RAND Health (2010), p. 1.
- 11 “Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?” RAND Corporation, RAND Health , 2010, p. 2.
- 12 “Is Physician Cost Profiling Ready for Prime Time?” By RAND Corporation, RAND Health , 2010, p. 2.
- 13 “Doctors Slam Insurance Over Their Rankings,” By Anna Wilde Mathews, The Wall Street Journal (July 20, 2010).
- 14 “Doctors Slam Insurance Over Their Rankings,” By Anna Wilde Mathews, The Wall Street Journal (July 20, 2010).
- 15 “Letter addressed to CEO and Chief Medical Officer of 47 health plans around the country,” By AMA, et. al., (July 16, 2010), p. 2.
- 16 “Letter addressed to CEO and Chief Medical Officer of 47 health plans around the country,” By AMA, et. al., (July 16, 2010), p. 1.
- 17 “Letter addressed to CEO and Chief Medical Officer of 47 health plans around the country,” By AMA, et. al., (July 16, 2010), p. 1.
- 18 “Letter addressed to CEO and Chief Medical Officer of 47 health plans around the country,” By AMA, et. al., (July 16, 2010), p. 2.



(800) FYI - VALU
Providing Solutions
in the Era of
Healthcare Reform

Founded in 1993, HCC is a nationally recognized healthcare economic financial consulting firm

- [HCC Home](#)
- [Firm Profile](#)
- [HCC Services](#)
- [HCC Experts](#)
- [Clients Projects](#)
- [HCC News](#)
- [Upcoming Events](#)
- [Contact Us](#)
- [Email Us](#)



Robert James Cimasi, MHA, ASA, FRICS, MCBA, AVA, CM&AA, serves as President of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS** (HCC), a nationally recognized healthcare financial and economic consulting firm headquartered in St. Louis, MO, serving clients in 49 states since 1993. Mr. Cimasi has over thirty years of experience in serving clients, with a professional focus on the financial and economic aspects of healthcare service sector entities including: valuation consulting and capital formation services; healthcare industry transactions including joint ventures, mergers, acquisitions, and divestitures; litigation support & expert testimony; and, certificate-of-need and other regulatory and policy planning consulting.

Mr. Cimasi holds a Masters in Health Administration from the University of Maryland, as well as several professional designations: Accredited Senior Appraiser (ASA – American Society of Appraisers); Fellow Royal Intuition of Chartered Surveyors (FRICS – Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors); Master Certified Business Appraiser (MCBA – Institute of Business Appraisers); Accredited Valuation Analyst (AVA – National Association of Certified Valuators and Analysts); and, Certified Merger & Acquisition Advisor (CM&AA – Alliance of Merger & Acquisition Advisors). He has served as an expert witness on cases in numerous courts, and has provided testimony before federal and state legislative committees. He is a nationally known speaker on healthcare industry topics, the author of several books, the latest of which include: “*The U.S. Healthcare Certificate of Need Sourcebook*” [2005 - Beard Books], “*An Exciting Insight into the Healthcare Industry and Medical Practice Valuation*” [2002 – AICPA], and “*A Guide to Consulting Services for Emerging Healthcare Organizations*” [1999 John Wiley and Sons].

Mr. Cimasi is the author of numerous additional chapters in anthologies; books, and legal treatises; published articles in peer reviewed and industry trade journals; research papers and case studies; and, is often quoted by healthcare industry press. In 2006, Mr. Cimasi was honored with the prestigious “*Shannon Pratt Award in Business Valuation*” conferred by the Institute of Business Appraisers. Mr. Cimasi serves on the Editorial Board of the Business Appraisals Practice of the Institute of Business Appraisers, of which he is a member of the College of Fellows.



Todd A. Zigrang, MBA, MHA, ASA, FACHE, is the Senior Vice President of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS** (HCC), where he focuses on the areas valuation and financial analysis for hospitals and other healthcare enterprises. Mr. Zigrang has significant physician integration and financial analysis experience, and has participated in the development of a physician-owned multi-specialty MSO and networks involving a wide range of specialties; physician-owned hospitals, as well as several limited liability companies for the purpose of acquiring acute care and specialty hospitals, ASCs and other ancillary facilities; participated in the evaluation and negotiation of managed care contracts, performed and assisted in the valuation of various healthcare entities and related litigation support engagements; created pro-forma financials; written business plans; conducted a range of industry research; completed due diligence practice analysis; overseen the selection process for vendors, contractors, and architects; and, worked on the arrangement of financing.

Mr. Zigrang holds a Master of Science in Health Administration and a Masters in Business Administration from the University of Missouri at Columbia, and is a Fellow of the American College of Healthcare Executives. He has co-authored “*Research and Financial Benchmarking in the Healthcare Industry*” (STP Financial Management) and “*Healthcare Industry Research and its Application in Financial Consulting*” (Aspen Publishers). He has additionally taught before the Institute of Business Appraisers and CPA Leadership Institute, and has presented healthcare industry valuation related research papers before the Healthcare Financial Management Association; the National CPA Health Care Adviser’s Association; Association for Corporate Growth; Infocast Executive Education Series; the St. Louis Business Valuation Roundtable; and, Physician Hospitals of America.



Anne P. Sharamitaro, Esq., is the Vice President of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS** (HCC), where she focuses on the areas of Certificate of Need (CON); regulatory compliance, managed care, and antitrust consulting. Ms. Sharamitaro is a member of the Missouri Bar and holds a J.D. and Health Law Certificate from Saint Louis University School of Law, where she served as an editor for the Journal of Health Law, published by the American Health Lawyers Association. She has presented healthcare industry related research papers before Physician Hospitals of America and the National Association of Certified Valuation Analysts and co-authored chapters in “*Healthcare Organizations: Financial Management Strategies*,” published in 2008.

HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC) is an established, nationally recognized healthcare financial and economic consulting firm headquartered in St. Louis, Missouri, with regional personnel nationwide. Founded in 1993, HCC has served clients in over 45 states, in providing services including: valuation in all healthcare sectors; financial analysis, including the development of forecasts, budgets and income distribution plans; healthcare provider related intermediary services, including integration, affiliation, acquisition and divestiture; Certificate of Need (CON) and regulatory consulting; litigation support and expert witness services; and, industry research services for healthcare providers and their advisors. HCC's accredited professionals are supported by an experienced research and library support staff to maintain a thorough and extensive knowledge of the healthcare reimbursement, regulatory, technological and competitive environment.