

FTC Halts Merger of Chicago Health Systems

On March 7, 2017, *NorthShore University HealthSystem* and *Advocate Health Care* announced their abandonment of plans to merge into one hospital system.¹ This decision was announced approximately fifteen months after the *Federal Trade Commission* (FTC) filed a complaint to enjoin the merger in December 2015.² This potential union would have created the eleventh largest not-for-profit hospital system in the U.S., comprising sixteen hospitals spanning from the north Chicago suburbs to central Illinois.³ In regard to the abandoned merger plans, NorthShore CEO Mark Neaman stated, “we have determined with the Advocate Health Care leadership that the time, cost and uncertainty of pursuing any additional appeals would not be worthwhile.”⁴ Advocate CEO Jim Skogsbergh additionally explained that the two hospital systems “pursued this merger because it aligned with [Advocate’s] mission and values to advance care and lower costs for patients.”⁵

Initial plans to create the “*Advocate Northshore Health Partners*” system were publicized in November 2014.⁶ The December 2015 complaint filed by the FTC and Attorney General for the State of Illinois attempted to threaten this merger.⁷ In the complaint, the FTC argued that the combined entity would violate Section 7 of the Clayton Act, which prohibits mergers whose effect “may be substantially to lessen competition, or to tend to create a monopoly.”⁸ The FTC further argued that the merger would:

- (1) “Significantly increase market concentration and result in such a highly concentrated market that the Transaction is presumptively unlawful”;
- (2) “Increase Defendants’ bargaining leverage with commercial payers, and enhance Defendants’ ability to negotiate more favorable reimbursement terms, including reimbursement rates. Faced with higher rates and other less favorable terms, commercial payers will be forced to pass on those higher healthcare costs to employers and their employees in the form of increased premiums, co-pays, deductibles, and other out-of-pocket expenses”; and,
- (3) “[Diminish] incentive[s] to improve [the] quality of care or increase [the] service offerings to patients in [Chicago].”⁹

Advocate responded to the complaint, stating that the FTC’s claims were “an imprudent and fundamentally unsound application of the antitrust laws to the merger... that seeks to perpetuate the status quo at the expense of innovation that would benefit consumers,”¹⁰ and that the proposed merger would “be precompetitive, and will result in substantial merger-specific pricing efficiencies, cost synergies, and other procompetitive effects all of which will directly benefit consumers and patients throughout Chicago.”¹¹ NorthShore echoed these arguments, stating that “the Complaint [filed by the FTC and Attorney General for the State of Illinois] is fundamentally flawed and reflects a misguided application of the antitrust laws to the merger... because both organizations face robust and increasing competition today and in the future.”¹² NorthShore further articulated that “the merger... will be precompetitive and will further enhance the quality of care for patients and lower the total cost of healthcare.”¹³

On October 31, 2016, after a series of proceedings related to an interlocutory appeal of a preliminary injunction, the Seventh Circuit granted the preliminary injunction to the FTC and State of Illinois.¹⁴ This decision was made after the FTC was able to successfully define the geographic market served by both Advocate and NorthShore.¹⁵ The case was then remanded back to the district court for further proceedings.¹⁶ On March 7, 2017, the district court granted an injunction to the FTC and State of Illinois to enjoin the health systems from merging until after the case was adjudicated.¹⁷ That same day, Advocate and NorthShore announced plans to abandon their proposed merger.¹⁸

On May 5, 2017, shortly after the merger plans terminated, Advocate announced that it was cutting expenses by \$200 million.¹⁹ Advocate asserted that these budget cuts are not directly attributable to the legal costs of the lawsuit, but are instead a consequence of its increasing financial pressures, an issue that many hospitals are facing.²⁰ Over the past few years, numerous Chicago hospitals have experienced an increase in amount of unpaid hospital bills.²¹ In 2016, Advocate saw its uncollectible accounts increase more than 22%.²² Other Chicago hospitals, such as Lurie Children’s Hospital and Swedish Covenant Hospital, experienced increases in bad debt of 22% and 71% in 2015, respectively.²³ David Szandzik, Vice President of

(Continued on next page)

Revenue Cycle at Advocate, blamed this trend on an “increase in deductibles and overall patient financial responsibility under today’s insurance plans.”²⁴ Additionally, Chicago hospitals are facing a unique dilemma, in that they are waiting to be reimbursed for services from the State of Illinois, which has not passed a budget in two years.²⁵ As Advocate Chief Operating Officer, Bill Santulli, noted, “operating in a state with one of the lowest reimbursement rates and significant payment delays due to the lack of state budget exacerbates [this] situation.”²⁶ Had the merger been approved, Advocate Chief Executive Officer, Jim Skogsbergh, claims that both Advocate and NorthShore “would have had a better opportunity to weather [this] storm.”²⁷ In addition to the budget cuts, Advocate is instituting a hiring freeze until at least July 1, 2017, and plans to initiate layoffs and early retirements.²⁸ The system is also in conversations with other rival providers regarding possible consolidation.²⁹

However, not all Chicago hospitals are suffering from paralyzing increases in bad debt. For example, Northwestern Memorial Hospital experienced a six percent *decline* in bad debt in 2016.³⁰ Spokesman Chris King attributed this decrease to improvements in their revenue cycle and “enhanced engagement between our financial counselors and patients to improve access to our financial assistance programs.”³¹ Northwestern and other academic medical centers, such as the University of Chicago, have acquired several community hospitals in an attempt to increase their economies of scale and combat financial uncertainties.³²

Nonetheless, the collapse of the Advocate-NorthShore merger may have a deterrent effect on future mergers both in Chicago and across the U.S.³³ Future consolidation, especially the consolidation of large hospital systems, may draw significant regulatory scrutiny if the amount of market share acquired by healthcare organizations results in too much market power in the eyes of federal and state regulators.³⁴

1 “Advocate, Northshore drop plans to merge” By Brigid Sweeney, Modern Healthcare (March 7, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170307/NEWS/170309912> (Accessed 5/9/2017).

2 “Federal Trade Commission, et al. v. Advocate Health Care Network, et al.” Case No. 15-cv-11473 (December 22, 2015) Complaint for Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction Pursuant to Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, p. 1.

3 “The latest jabs in Advocate, Northshore fight to merge” By Kristen Schorsch, Modern Healthcare (December 16, 2016), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20161216/NEWS/16219923> (Accessed 5/9/2017).

4 “Advocate, Northshore drop plans to merge” By Brigid Sweeney, Modern Healthcare (March 7, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170307/NEWS/170309912> (Accessed 5/9/2017).

5 *Ibid.*

6 “Appeals court rules against Advocate, Northshore hospital merger” By Lisa Schencker, Chicago Tribune (May 9, 2017), <http://www.chicagotribune.com/business/ct-advocate-northshore-merger-ruling-1101-biz-20161031-story.html> (Accessed 5/9/2017); “Analysis: Decision time in Advocate/Northshore merger battle” By Kristen Schorsch, Modern Healthcare (November 1, 2016), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20161101/NEWS/311019998/analysis-decision-time-in-advocate-northshore-merger-battle> (Accessed 5/10/2017).

7 “Advocate, Northshore drop plans to merge” By Brigid Sweeney, Modern Healthcare (March 7, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170307/NEWS/170309912> (Accessed 5/9/2017).

8 “Federal Trade Commission, et al. v. Advocate Health Care Network, et al.” Case No. 15-cv-11473 (December 22, 2015), Complaint for Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction Pursuant to Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, p. 2; “Clayton Act” 15 U.S.C. § 18 (2004).

9 “Federal Trade Commission, et al. v. Advocate Health Care Network, et al.” Case No. 15-cv-11473 (December 22, 2015), Complaint for Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction Pursuant to Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, p. 2-5.

10 “Federal Trade Commission, et al. v. Advocate Health Care Network, et al.” Case No. 15-cv-11473 (January 6, 2016), Advocate’s Response to the Commission’s Allegations, p. 1-2.

11 *Ibid.*

12 “Federal Trade Commission, et al. v. Advocate Health Care Network, et al.” Case No. 15-cv-11473 (January 5, 2016),

NorthShore University Health System’s Answer to Administrative Complaint, p. 1-2.

13 *Ibid.*

14 “Federal Trade Commission, et al. v. Advocate Health Care Network, et al.” Case No. 15-cv-11473 (October 31, 2016), Final Judgment, p. 1.

15 “Judge explains the flip-flop that spiked NorthShore-Advocate deal” By Kristen Schorsch, Modern Healthcare (March 16, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170316/NEWS/170319911> (Accessed 5/10/2017).

16 Case No. 15-cv-11473, (October 31, 2016).

17 “Statement from Federal Trade Commission’s Bureau of Competition Acting Director on District Court Ruling to Enjoin Advocate/NorthShore Hospital Merger” Press Release, March 7, 2017, <https://www.ftc.gov/news-events/press-releases/2017/03/statement-federal-trade-commissions-bureau-competition-acting> (Accessed 5/11/2017).

18 “Advocate, Northshore drop plans to merge” By Brigid Sweeney, Modern Healthcare (March 7, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170307/NEWS/170309912> (Accessed 5/9/2017).

19 “Advocate Health Care plans \$200 million in cuts” Crain’s Chicago Business, Modern Healthcare (May 5, 2017), http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170505/NEWS/170509918?utm_source=modernhealthcare&utm_medium=email&utm_content=20170505-NEWS-1 (Accessed 5/9/2017).

20 *Ibid.*

21 *Ibid.*

22 “Feel like the hospital is shaking you down over that bill? It probably is.” By Brigid Sweeney, Modern Healthcare (March 28, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170328/NEWS/170329910> (Accessed 5/11/2017).

23 *Ibid.*

24 *Ibid.*

25 “Advocate Health Care plans \$200 million in cuts” Crain’s Chicago Business, Modern Healthcare (May 5, 2017), http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170505/NEWS/170509918?utm_source=modernhealthcare&utm_medium=email&utm_content=20170505-NEWS-1 (Accessed 5/9/2017).

26 “Advocate Health Care imposes hiring freeze” Crain’s Chicago Business, Modern Healthcare (April 21, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170421/NEWS/170429957> (Accessed 5/9/2017).

27 Crain’s Chicago Business, (May 5, 2017).

28 *Ibid.*

29 *Ibid.*

-
- 30 “Feel like the hospital is shaking you down over that bill? It probably is.” By Brigid Sweeney, Modern Healthcare (March 28, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170328/NEWS/170329910> (Accessed 5/11/2017).
- 31 *Ibid.*
- 32 “The big winner in Advocate, Northshore breakup? Blue Cross” By Kristen Schorsch and Brigid Sweeney, Modern Healthcare (March 8, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170308/NEWS/170309898> (Accessed 5/9/2017); “Analysis: Decision time in Advocate/Northshore merger battle” By Kristen Schorsch, Modern Healthcare (November 1, 2016), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20161101/NEWS/311019998/analysis-decision-time-in-advocate-northshore-merger-battle> (Accessed 5/10/2017).
- 33 “The big winner in Advocate, Northshore breakup? Blue Cross” By Kristen Schorsch and Brigid Sweeney, Modern Healthcare (March 8, 2017), <http://www.modernhealthcare.com/article/20170308/NEWS/170309898> (Accessed 5/9/2017).
- 34 *Ibid.*



(800)FYI - VALU

Providing Solutions
in the Era of
Healthcare Reform

Founded in 1993, HCC is a
nationally recognized healthcare
economic financial consulting firm

- [HCC Home](#)
- [Firm Profile](#)
- [HCC Services](#)
- [HCC Experts](#)
- [Clients & Projects](#)
- [HCC News](#)
- [Upcoming Events](#)
- [Contact Us](#)
- [Email Us](#)

HCC Services

- [Valuation Consulting](#)
- [Commercial Reasonableness Opinions](#)
- [Commercial Payer Reimbursement Benchmarking](#)
- [Litigation Support & Expert Witness](#)
- [Financial Feasibility Analysis & Modeling](#)
- [Intermediary Services](#)
- [Certificate of Need](#)
- [ACO Value Metrics & Capital Formation](#)
- [Strategic Consulting](#)
- [Industry Research Services](#)



Robert James Cimasi, MHA, ASA, FRICS, MCBA, CVA, CM&AA, serves as Chief Executive Officer of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC)**, a nationally recognized healthcare financial and economic consulting firm headquartered in St. Louis, MO, serving clients in 49 states since 1993. Mr. Cimasi has over thirty years of experience in serving clients, with a professional focus on the financial and economic aspects of healthcare service sector entities including: valuation consulting and capital formation services; healthcare industry transactions including joint ventures, mergers, acquisitions, and divestitures; litigation support & expert testimony; and, certificate-of-need and other regulatory and policy planning consulting.

Mr. Cimasi holds a Master in Health Administration from the University of Maryland, as well as several professional designations: Accredited Senior Appraiser (ASA – American Society of Appraisers); Fellow Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors (FRICS – Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors); Master Certified Business Appraiser (MCBA – Institute of Business Appraisers); Certified Valuation Analyst (CVA – National Association of Certified Valuators and Analysts); and, Certified Merger & Acquisition Advisor (CM&AA – Alliance of Merger & Acquisition Advisors). He has served as an expert witness on cases in numerous courts, and has provided testimony before federal and state legislative committees. He is a nationally known speaker on healthcare industry topics, and is the author of several books, the latest of which include: *“The Adviser’s Guide to Healthcare – 2nd Edition”* [2015 – AICPA]; *“Healthcare Valuation: The Financial Appraisal of Enterprises, Assets, and Services”* [2014 – John Wiley & Sons]; *“Accountable Care Organizations: Value Metrics and Capital Formation”* [2013 – Taylor & Francis, a division of CRC Press]; and, *“The U.S. Healthcare Certificate of Need Sourcebook”* [2005 – Beard Books].

Mr. Cimasi is the author of numerous additional chapters in anthologies; books, and legal treatises; published articles in peer reviewed and industry trade journals; research papers and case studies; and, is often quoted by healthcare industry press. In 2006, Mr. Cimasi was honored with the prestigious *“Shannon Pratt Award in Business Valuation”* conferred by the Institute of Business Appraisers. Mr. Cimasi serves on the Editorial Board of the Business Appraisals Practice of the Institute of Business Appraisers, of which he is a member of the College of Fellows. In 2011, he was named a Fellow of the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors (RICS). In 2016, Mr. Cimasi was named a *“Pioneer of the Profession”* as part of the recognition of the *National Association of Certified Valuators and Analysts (NACVA)* *“Industry Titans”* awards, which distinguishes those whom have had the greatest impact on the valuation profession.



Todd A. Zigrang, MBA, MHA, ASA, FACHE, is the President of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC)**, where he focuses on the areas of valuation and financial analysis for hospitals, physician practices, and other healthcare enterprises. Mr. Zigrang has over 20 years of experience providing valuation, financial, transaction and strategic advisory services nationwide in over 1,000 transactions and joint ventures. Mr. Zigrang is also considered an expert in the field of healthcare compensation for physicians, executives and other professionals.

Mr. Zigrang is the co-author of *“The Adviser’s Guide to Healthcare – 2nd Edition”* [2015 – AICPA], numerous chapters in legal treatises and anthologies, and peer-reviewed and industry articles such as: *The Accountant’s Business Manual* (AICPA); *Valuing Professional Practices and Licenses* (Aspen Publishers); *Valuation Strategies: Business Appraisal Practice*; and, *NACVA QuickRead*. In addition to his contributions as an author, Mr. Zigrang has served as faculty before professional and trade associations such as the American Society of Appraisers (ASA); the National Association of Certified Valuators and Analysts (NACVA); Physician Hospitals of America (PHA); the Institute of Business Appraisers (IBA); the Healthcare Financial Management Association (HFMA); and, the CPA Leadership Institute.

Mr. Zigrang holds a Master of Science in Health Administration (MHA) and a Master of Business Administration (MBA) from the University of Missouri at Columbia. He is a Fellow of the American College of Healthcare Executives (FACHE) and holds the Accredited Senior Appraiser (ASA) designation from the American Society of Appraisers, where he has served as President of the St. Louis Chapter, and is current Chair of the ASA Healthcare Special Interest Group (HSIG).



John R. Chwarzinski, MSF, MAE, is Senior Vice President of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC)**. Mr. Chwarzinski’s areas of expertise include advanced statistical analysis, econometric modeling, as well as, economic and financial analysis. Mr. Chwarzinski is the co-author of peer-reviewed and industry articles published in *Business Valuation Review* and *NACVA QuickRead*, and he has spoken before the Virginia Medical Group Management Association (VMGMA) and the Midwest Accountable Care Organization Expo.

Mr. Chwarzinski holds a Master’s Degree in Economics from the University of Missouri – St. Louis, as well as, a Master’s Degree in Finance from the John M. Olin School of Business at Washington University in St. Louis. He is a member of the St. Louis Chapter of the American Society of Appraisers, as well as a candidate for the Accredited Senior Appraiser designation from the American Society of Appraisers.



Jessica L. Bailey-Wheaton, Esq., is Vice President and General Counsel of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC)**, where she conducts project management and consulting services related to the impact of both federal and state regulations on healthcare exempt organization transactions and provides research services necessary to support certified opinions of value related to the Fair Market Value and Commercial Reasonableness of transactions related to healthcare enterprises, assets, and services. Ms. Bailey-Wheaton is a member of the Missouri and Illinois Bars and holds a J.D., with a concentration in Health Law, from Saint Louis University School of Law, where she served as Fall Managing Editor for the *Journal of Health Law & Policy*.



Daniel J. Chen, MSF, is a Senior Financial Analyst at **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC)**, where he develops fair market value and commercial reasonableness opinions related to healthcare enterprises, assets, and services. In addition he prepares, reviews and analyzes forecasted and pro forma financial statements to determine the most probable future net economic benefit related to healthcare enterprises, assets, and services and applies utilization demand and reimbursement trends to project professional medical revenue streams and ancillary services and technical component (ASTC) revenue streams. Mr. Chen has a M.S. in Finance from Washington University St. Louis.