

Causes of Wasteful Spending in the U.S. Healthcare System

The first article of this three-part Health Capital Topics series on the decreasing marginal utility in healthcare, discussed the exponential increase of U.S. healthcare expenditures in recent years, which has not necessarily resulted in better health outcomes for the U.S. population. Healthcare costs accounted for over 17% of the U.S. *gross domestic product (GDP)* in 2011, and continues to grow at much higher rates than other comparable industrialized nations,¹ indicating that the U.S. may not be receiving sufficient “*value per dollar*” spent on the population’s healthcare. One approach to increasing the “*value per dollar*” spent on healthcare is to reduce wasteful spending in the healthcare system. Reducing this wasteful spending necessitates the identification of the various types of waste in the U.S. healthcare system. The second installment of this three-part series will examine the different sources of waste that have allowed such inefficient and unsustainable healthcare spending to thrive in the U.S. despite the declining yield on investment.

In the context of healthcare spending, *waste* is defined as spending that could be eliminated without harming consumers or reducing the quality of care.² A 2013 study by the *Institute of Medicine* estimated that approximately 30% of healthcare spending, or roughly \$750 billion, was squandered on unnecessary or poorly delivered services, excessive administrative costs, fraudulent claims, and other needless costs in 2009.³ An April 2012 study published in the *Journal of the American Medical Association (JAMA)* estimated that six categories of wasteful spending (described below) annually consumed between \$558 billion and \$1.26 trillion, amounting to approximately 21% to 47% of total healthcare expenditures in the U.S.⁴

Failures of Care Delivery

The April 2012 JAMA study categorized the first type healthcare waste as *failures of care delivery*. This type of waste can be attributed to poor execution of effective preventive care and patient safety practices resulting in worse clinical outcomes and higher costs, such as *preventable adverse events*, which is defined as injuries to a patient caused by the medical intervention (rather than the underlying medical condition).⁵ A U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) report estimated that these *preventable adverse events* led to roughly \$4.4 billion in additional Medicare spending in 2009.⁶ Overall, the April 2012 JAMA study

estimated that waste resulting from *failures of care delivery* consumed between \$102 and \$154 billion in 2011.⁷

Failures of Care Coordination

Failures of care coordination account for the second category of waste,⁸ which results from fragmented care due to a lack of communication and coordination between providers, and may lead to unnecessary hospital readmissions and preventable health complications.⁹ A 2013 JAMA study on readmission rates of common hospital conditions found that from 2007 to 2009, the 30-day readmission rate was: (1) 24.8% after hospitalizations for heart failure; (2) 19.9% after hospitalizations for acute myocardial infarction; and, (3) 18.3% after hospitalizations for pneumonia.¹⁰ Overall, the April 2012 JAMA study estimated that the waste resulting from *failures of care coordination* accounted for approximately \$25 billion to \$45 billion in 2011.¹¹

Overtreatment

A third category of waste is attributed to *overtreatment*, which occurs when patients are subjected to medical services at a higher volume or cost than necessary.¹² One significant source of overtreatment is the practice of *defensive medicine*, when healthcare providers order unnecessary tests or services to protect themselves against malpractice liability.¹³ In 2011, waste due to *overtreatment* was estimated by the April 2012 JAMA study to represent between \$158 billion and \$226 billion of wasteful healthcare spending.¹⁴

Administrative Complexity

Administrative complexity, a fourth category of waste, results from the inefficient and overly bureaucratic procedures of public and private health insurers, as well as accreditation agencies.¹⁵ For example, physicians spend an average of approximately three hours per week interacting with health plans rather than on patient care.¹⁶ When the amount of time devoted to such interactions by nursing and clerical staffs was included, the total time spent interacting with health insurers cost physician practices approximately \$23 billion to \$31 billion annually.¹⁷ Overall, the April 2012 JAMA study estimated that waste due to *administrative complexity* accounted for approximately \$107 billion to \$389 billion in 2011.¹⁸

Pricing Failures

A fifth category of wasteful healthcare spending may be attributed to *pricing failures*, which occurs when prices for healthcare services grossly deviate from those in well-functioning markets.¹⁹ For example, the 30 most commonly prescribed drugs in the U.S. are 33% more expensive than those same drugs in Canada and Germany, and more than double the prices of those sold in Australia, France, and the United Kingdom.²⁰ Additionally, U.S. primary care physicians receive higher fees for office visits, and orthopedic physicians receive higher fees for hip replacements, than in Australia, Canada, France, Germany and the United Kingdom.²¹ Overall, the 2012 JAMA study estimated the cost of pricing failures to total between \$84 billion and \$178 billion in 2011.²²

Fraud and Abuse

The sixth type of waste is categorized as *fraud and abuse*.²³ *Fraud* is defined in the healthcare industry as an “*intentional deception or misrepresentation*” that can lead to unauthorized benefits or payments, and *abuse* is defined as “*actions that are improper, inappropriate, outside acceptable standards of professional conduct, or medically unnecessary*.”²⁴ Examples of *fraud and abuse* include:

- (1) Submitting claims for services not provided;
- (2) Misrepresenting the frequency, description, or duration of services provided;
- (3) Falsifying eligibility;
- (4) Failing to maintain adequate financial or medical records; and,
- (5) Improper billing practices.²⁵

In 2011, the amount spent on fraudulent claims, as well as the additional enforcement activities to catch the wrongdoers, totaled between \$82 billion and \$272 billion.²⁶ Although *fraud and abuse* continues to be a major source of waste in healthcare spending, substantial progress has been made in recent years. Since the enactment of the *Affordable Care Act (ACA)*, the *Department of Justice (DOJ)* and *Office of Inspector General (OIG)* have increased both enforcement efforts and willingness to prosecute fraud and abuse violations. The DOJ recently announced a record-breaking recovery of \$4.3 billion in fiscal year 2013 from individuals and entities who attempted to defraud federal healthcare programs.²⁷ This pattern of increased enforcement could significantly reduce waste in the U.S. healthcare system in the coming years.

Despite the recent flattening of U.S. healthcare expenditures per capita, policy makers are debating how to best combat wasteful spending. The key to reducing expenditures may well lie, in great part, in understanding these underlying causes of waste in the U.S. healthcare system. The third and final installment of this three-part series will examine various aspects of the latest iteration of healthcare reform which are designed to reduce wasteful spending and make healthcare more affordable.

- 1 “National Health Spending in 2011: Overall Growth Remains Low, but Some Payers and Services Show Signs of Acceleration,” By Micah Hartman, et al., *Health Affairs*, Vol. 32, no. 1 (January 2013), p. 87-88.
- 2 “Reducing Waste in Health Care,” *Health Policy Briefs*, Health Affairs, December 13, 2012, https://www.healthaffairs.org/healthpolicybriefs/brief.php?brief_id=82 (Accessed 4/1/2014).
- 3 “Best Care at Lower Cost: The Path to Continuously Learning Health Care in America,” Institute of Medicine, 2013.
- 4 “Eliminating Waste in US Health Care,” Donald M. Berwick & Andrew D. Hackbarth, *The Journal of the American Medical Association*, Vol. 306, No. 14, April 11, 2012, p. 1514.
- 5 *Ibid*, p. 1513.
- 6 “Adverse Events in Hospitals: National Incidence Among Medicare Beneficiaries,” Department of Health and Human Services, Office of Inspector General, November 2010, p. 27.
- 7 Donald M. Berwick & Andrew D. Hackbarth, “Eliminating Waste in US Health Care,” April 11, 2012, p. 1513.
- 8 *Ibid*, p. 1513-14.
- 9 *Ibid*, p. 1514.
- 10 “Diagnoses and Timing of 30-Day Readmissions After Hospitalization for Heart Failure, Acute Myocardial Infarction, or Pneumonia,” Kumar Dharmaraja, et al., *The Journal of the American Medical Association*, Vol. 309, No. 4, January 2013.
- 11 Donald M. Berwick & Andrew D. Hackbarth, “Eliminating Waste in US Health Care,” April 11, 2012, p. 1514.
- 12 *Ibid*, p. 1514.
- 13 *Health Affairs*, December 13, 2012.
- 14 Donald M. Berwick & Andrew D. Hackbarth, “Eliminating Waste in US Health Care,” April 11, 2012, p. 1514.
- 15 *Ibid*, p. 1514.
- 16 “What does it cost physician practices to interact with health insurance plans?” Lawrence P. Casalino, et al., *Health Affairs*, Vol. 28, No. 4, August 2009.
- 17 *Ibid*.
- 18 Donald M. Berwick & Andrew D. Hackbarth, “Eliminating Waste in US Health Care,” April 11, 2012, p. 1514.
- 19 *Ibid*.
- 20 “Explaining High Health Care Spending in the United States: An International Comparison of Supply, Utilization, Prices, and Quality,” David A. Squires, *The Commonwealth Fund*, Issues in International Health Policy, May 2012, http://www.commonwealthfund.org/~media/Files/Publications/Issue%20Brief/2012/May/1595_Squires_explaining_high_hlt_car_e_spending_intl_brief.pdf (Accessed 4/1/2014) p. 5.
- 21 *Ibid*, p. 5-7.
- 22 Donald M. Berwick & Andrew D. Hackbarth, “Eliminating Waste in US Health Care,” April 11, 2012, p. 1514.
- 23 *Ibid*.
- 24 “What is Health Care Fraud and Abuse?” Health Net Federal Services, https://www.hnfs.com/content/hnfs/home/tn/bene/claims/what_is_fraud.html (Accessed 4/1/2014).
- 25 *Ibid*.
- 26 Donald M. Berwick & Andrew D. Hackbarth, “Eliminating Waste in US Health Care,” April 11, 2012, p. 1514.
- 27 “Departments of Justice and Health and Human Services Announce Record-Breaking Recoveries Resulting from Joint Efforts to Combat Health Care Fraud,” Department of Health and Human Services Press Release, February 26, 2014, <http://www.hhs.gov/news/press/2014pres/02/20140226a.html> (Accessed 4/1/2014).



(800) FYI - VALU

*Providing Solutions
in the Era of
Healthcare Reform*

Founded in 1993, HCC is a
nationally recognized healthcare
economic financial consulting firm

- [HCC Home](#)
- [Firm Profile](#)
- [HCC Services](#)
- [HCC Experts](#)
- [Clients Projects](#)
- [HCC News](#)
- [Upcoming Events](#)
- [Contact Us](#)
- [Email Us](#)

HEALTH CAPITAL

CONSULTANTS (HCC) is an established, nationally recognized healthcare financial and economic consulting firm headquartered in St. Louis, Missouri, with regional personnel nationwide. Founded in 1993, HCC has served clients in over 45 states, in providing services including: valuation in all healthcare sectors; financial analysis, including the development of forecasts, budgets and income distribution plans; healthcare provider related intermediary services, including integration, affiliation, acquisition and divestiture; Certificate of Need (CON) and regulatory consulting; litigation support and expert witness services; and, industry research services for healthcare providers and their advisors. HCC's accredited professionals are supported by an experienced research and library support staff to maintain a thorough and extensive knowledge of the healthcare reimbursement, regulatory, technological and competitive environment.



Robert James Cimasi, MHA, ASA, FRICS, MCBA, CVA, CM&AA, serves as Chief Executive Officer of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC)**, a nationally recognized healthcare financial and economic consulting firm headquartered in St. Louis, MO, serving clients in 49 states since 1993. Mr. Cimasi has over thirty years of experience in serving clients, with a professional focus on the financial and economic aspects of healthcare service sector entities including: valuation consulting and capital formation services; healthcare industry transactions including joint ventures, mergers, acquisitions, and divestitures; litigation support & expert testimony; and, certificate-of-need and other regulatory and policy planning consulting.

Mr. Cimasi holds a Masters in Health Administration from the University of Maryland, as well as several professional designations: Accredited Senior Appraiser (ASA – American Society of Appraisers); Fellow Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors (FRICS – Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors); Master Certified Business Appraiser (MCBA – Institute of Business Appraisers); Accredited Valuation Analyst (AVA – National Association of Certified Valuators and Analysts); and, Certified Merger & Acquisition Advisor (CM&AA – Alliance of Merger & Acquisition Advisors). He has served as an expert witness on cases in numerous courts, and has provided testimony before federal and state legislative committees. He is a nationally known speaker on healthcare industry topics, the author of several books, the latest of which include: *“Accountable Care Organizations: Value Metrics and Capital Formation”* [2013 - Taylor & Francis, a division of CRC Press], *“The Adviser’s Guide to Healthcare”* – Vols. I, II & III [2010 – AICPA], and *“The U.S. Healthcare Certificate of Need Sourcebook”* [2005 - Beard Books]. His most recent book, entitled *“Healthcare Valuation: The Financial Appraisal of Enterprises, Assets, and Services”* was published by John Wiley & Sons in March 2014.

Mr. Cimasi is the author of numerous additional chapters in anthologies; books, and legal treatises; published articles in peer reviewed and industry trade journals; research papers and case studies; and, is often quoted by healthcare industry press. In 2006, Mr. Cimasi was honored with the prestigious *“Shannon Pratt Award in Business Valuation”* conferred by the Institute of Business Appraisers.

Mr. Cimasi serves on the Editorial Board of the Business Appraisals Practice of the Institute of Business Appraisers, of which he is a member of the College of Fellows. In 2011, he was named a Fellow of the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors (RICS).



Todd A. Zigrang, MBA, MHA, ASA, FACHE, is the President of **HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC)**, where he focuses on the areas valuation and financial analysis for hospitals and other healthcare enterprises. Mr. Zigrang has significant physician integration and financial analysis experience, and has participated in the development of a physician-owned multi-specialty MSO and networks involving a wide range of specialties; physician-owned hospitals, as well as several limited liability companies for the purpose of acquiring acute care and specialty hospitals, ASCs and other ancillary facilities; participated in the evaluation and negotiation of managed care contracts, performed and assisted in the valuation of various healthcare entities and related litigation support engagements; created pro-forma financials; written business plans; conducted a range of industry research; completed due diligence practice analysis; overseen the selection process for vendors, contractors, and architects; and, worked on the arrangement of financing.

Mr. Zigrang holds a Master of Science in Health Administration and a Masters in Business Administration from the University of Missouri at Columbia. He is a Fellow of the American College of Healthcare Executives, and serves as President of the St. Louis Chapter of the American Society of Appraisers (ASA). He has co-authored *“Research and Financial Benchmarking in the Healthcare Industry”* (STP Financial Management) and *“Healthcare Industry Research and its Application in Financial Consulting”* (Aspen Publishers). He has additionally taught before the Institute of Business Appraisers and CPA Leadership Institute, and has presented healthcare industry valuation related research papers before the Healthcare Financial Management Association; the National CPA Health Care Adviser’s Association; Association for Corporate Growth; Infocast Executive Education Series; the St. Louis Business Valuation Roundtable; and, Physician Hospitals of America.