

## Illinois ASC's Antitrust Claims Against Hospital Survive Summary Judgment

On December 30, 2009, Judge Michael M. Mihm of the United States District Court for the Central District of Illinois denied summary judgment with respect to Peoria Day Surgery Center's (PDSC) claims alleging that OSF Healthcare System (OSF), d/b/a Saint Francis Medical Center (SFMC), violated the Sherman Act and tortiously interfered with the prospective economic advantages between PDSC and Midwest Orthopedic Center (MOC), which was considering entering into a joint venture with PDSC. Accordingly, Judge Mihm's decision permits PDSC to pursue these claims against SFMC at trial.<sup>1</sup>

Judge Mihm's December 30<sup>th</sup> decision also granted summary judgment with respect to PDSC's claims alleging SFMC tortiously interfered with the contractual relationships and prospective economic advantages between PDSC and Caterpillar, and PDSC and Humana, dismissing these claims.<sup>2</sup>

PDSC's second amended complaint, which was filed on April 7, 2009, alleged that SFMC engaged in illegal tying by entering into an exclusive contract with Caterpillar in 2001 under which SFMC would be reimbursed at an in-network rate for the provision of inpatient and outpatient ambulatory surgery services to members of Caterpillar's self-insured health policy.<sup>3</sup> Under the agreement, Caterpillar would reimburse other ambulatory surgery centers (ASCs), including PDSC, at an out-of-network level of 70%, requiring members to pay the remaining 30%.<sup>4</sup>

In addition, PDSC claimed that SFMC violated the Illinois Antitrust Act by tortiously interfering with: (1) the contractual relationships and prospective economic advantages between PDSC and Caterpillar; (2) PDSC's prospective economic advantages with MOC; and, (3) the contractual relationships and prospective economic advantages between PDSC and Humana.<sup>5</sup>

In response to PDSC's complaint, SFMC filed a motion for summary judgment, claiming that there exist no genuine issues of material fact, and therefore, SFMC is entitled to judgment as a matter of law.<sup>6</sup>

Judge Mihm's decision is the latest development in litigation between PDSC and SFMC, which first commenced in September 2006.<sup>7</sup> However, similar antitrust suits have been brought by physician-owned facilities against hospitals in Kansas, Texas, and Arkansas.<sup>8</sup> Litigation in these cases centers on alleged

attempts by hospitals to restrict competition from physician-owned facilities. These practices are receiving increased attention because such anticompetitive actions by hospitals may result in higher costs and lower quality for patients.<sup>9</sup> Judge Mihm's December 30, 2009 decision to allow PDSC to pursue its antitrust claims against SFMC, along with increased antitrust litigation against hospitals nationwide, may cause some hospitals to reexamine potential anticompetitive behaviors and take steps to ensure their facilities comply with both state and federal antitrust laws.<sup>10</sup>

<sup>1</sup> *Peoria Day Surgery Center v. OSF Healthcare System, d/b/a Saint Francis Medical Center*, No. 06-1236, (C.D. Ill. Dec. 30, 2009) (order granting in part and denying in part motion for summary judgment).

<sup>2</sup> *Peoria Day Surgery Center v. OSF Healthcare System, d/b/a Saint Francis Medical Center*, No. 06-1236, (C.D. Ill. Dec. 30, 2009) (order granting in part and denying in part motion for summary judgment).

<sup>3</sup> *Peoria Day Surgery Center v. OSF Healthcare System, d/b/a Saint Francis Medical Center*, No. 06-1236, (C.D. Ill. Dec. 30, 2009) (order granting in part and denying in part motion for summary judgment).

<sup>4</sup> *Peoria Day Surgery Center v. OSF Healthcare System, d/b/a Saint Francis Medical Center*, No. 06-1236, (C.D. Ill. Dec. 30, 2009) (order granting in part and denying in part motion for summary judgment).

<sup>5</sup> *Peoria Day Surgery Center v. OSF Healthcare System, d/b/a Saint Francis Medical Center*, No. 06-1236, (C.D. Ill. Dec. 30, 2009) (order granting in part and denying in part motion for summary judgment).

<sup>6</sup> *Peoria Day Surgery Center v. OSF Healthcare System, d/b/a Saint Francis Medical Center*, No. 06-1236, (C.D. Ill. Dec. 30, 2009) (order granting in part and denying in part motion for summary judgment).

<sup>7</sup> "Court Refuses to Dismiss Sherman Act Claim Brought Against Hospital by Competing ASC," BNA's Health Law Reporter, Bureau of National Affairs, January 14, 2010,

[http://news.bna.com/hlln/display/batch\\_print\\_display.adp?searchid=10266455](http://news.bna.com/hlln/display/batch_print_display.adp?searchid=10266455) (Accessed January 27, 2010); "Peoria Day Surgery Center in Illinois Wins Dismissal Against Hospital's Complaint," Becker's ASC Review, December 11, 2008, <http://www.beckersasc.com/news-analysis-asc/antikickback-legal-regulatory/peoria-day-surgery-center-in-illinois-wins-dismissal-against-hospitals-complaint.html?q=peoria+day+surgery+center+illinois+wins+dismissal+against+hospital%5C%5C%5C%27s+complaint> (Accessed January 27, 2010).

<sup>8</sup> "Surgery Center Wins Right to Pursue Antitrust Claim" By Amy Lynn Sorrel, American Medical News, February 1, 2010, <http://www.ama-assn.org/amednews/2010/02/01/gvsb0201.htm> (Accessed February 2, 2010).

<sup>9</sup> "Surgery Center Wins Right to Pursue Antitrust Claim" By Amy Lynn Sorrel, American Medical News, February 1, 2010, <http://www.ama-assn.org/amednews/2010/02/01/gvsb0201.htm> (Accessed February 2, 2010).

<sup>10</sup> "Surgery Center Wins Right to Pursue Antitrust Claim" By Amy Lynn Sorrel, American Medical News, February 1, 2010, <http://www.ama-assn.org/amednews/2010/02/01/gvsb0201.htm>



(800) FYI - VALU

*Providing Solutions  
in the Era of  
Healthcare Reform*

Founded in 1993, HCC is a nationally recognized healthcare economic financial consulting firm

- [HCC Home](#)
- [Firm Profile](#)
- [HCC Services](#)
- [HCC Experts](#)
- [Clients Projects](#)
- [HCC News](#)
- [Upcoming Events](#)
- [Contact Us](#)
- [Email Us](#)

HEALTH CAPITAL CONSULTANTS (HCC) is an established, nationally recognized healthcare financial and economic consulting firm headquartered in St. Louis, Missouri, with regional personnel nationwide. Founded in 1993, HCC has served clients in over 45 states, in providing services including: valuation in all healthcare sectors; financial analysis, including the development of forecasts, budgets and income distribution plans; healthcare provider related intermediary services, including integration, affiliation, acquisition and divestiture; Certificate of Need (CON) and regulatory consulting; litigation support and expert witness services; and, industry research services for healthcare providers and their advisors. HCC's accredited professionals are supported by an experienced research and library support staff to maintain a thorough and extensive knowledge of the healthcare reimbursement, regulatory, technological and competitive environment.



**Robert James Cimasi**, MHA ASA, CBA, AVA, CM&AA, President. Mr. Cimasi is a nationally recognized healthcare industry expert, with over 25 years experience in serving clients, in 49 states, with a professional focus on the financial and economic aspects of healthcare industry including: valuation consulting; litigation support & expert testimony; business intermediary and capital formation services; certificate-of-need and other regulatory and policy planning; and, healthcare industry transactions, joint ventures, mergers and divestitures.

Mr. Cimasi holds a Masters in Health Administration from the University of Maryland, and several professional certifications. He has been certified and has served as an expert witness on cases in numerous states, and has provided testimony before federal and state legislative committees.

Mr. Cimasi is a nationally known speaker on healthcare industry topics, is the author of several nationally published books, chapters, published articles, research papers and case studies, and is often quoted by healthcare industry press. Mr. Cimasi's latest book, *"The U.S. Healthcare Certificate of Need Sourcebook"*, was published in 2005 by Beard Books. In 2006, Mr. Cimasi was honored with the prestigious *"Shannon Pratt Award in Business Valuation"* conferred by the Institute of Business Appraisers and was elevated to the Institute's College of Fellows in 2007.



**Todd A. Zigrang**, MHA, MBA, FACHE, Senior Vice-President. Mr. Zigrang has over twelve years experience in providing valuation, financial analysis, and provider integration services to HCC's clients nationwide. He has developed and implemented hospital and physician driven MSOs and networks involving a wide range of specialties; developed a physician-owned ambulatory surgery center; participated in the evaluation and negotiation of managed care contracts, performed valuations of a wide array of healthcare entities; participated in numerous litigation support engagements; created pro-forma financials; written business plans and feasibility analyses; conducted comprehensive industry research; completed due diligence analysis; overseen the selection process for vendors, contractors, and architects; and, developed project financing.

Mr. Zigrang holds a Masters in Business Administration and a Master of Science in Health Administration from the University of Missouri at Columbia. He holds the Certified Healthcare Executive (CHE) designation from, and is a Diplomat of, the American College of Healthcare Executives and a member of the Healthcare Financial Management Association.



**Anne P. Sharamitaro**, Esq., Vice President. Ms. Sharamitaro focuses on the areas of Certificate of Need (CON); regulatory compliance, managed care, and antitrust consulting. Ms. Sharamitaro was admitted to the Missouri bar after graduating with J.D. and Health Law Certificate from St. Louis University School of Law. At St. Louis University, served as an editor and staff member of the *Journal of Health Law*, published by the American Health Lawyers Association. She has presented healthcare industry related research papers before Physician Hospitals of America (f/k/a American Surgical Hospital Association) and the National Association of Certified Valuation Analysts.



**Rachel L. Seiler**, MPH, is a Senior Research Associate at Health Capital Consultants (HCC). Ms. Seiler holds a Masters in Public Health at Saint Louis University. At HCC, Ms. Seiler serves as a Sr. Project Manager for consulting services providing research for financial and economic analyses related to provider, physician, and executive compensation; valuation of healthcare enterprises, assets and services; healthcare industry trends and medical specialty trends; market demographics and competition; and, various regulatory, reimbursement and technology topics related to health policy and economic trends regarding a wide

and diverse array of healthcare industry topics. Ms. Seiler was co-author of the study entitled *"Market Impact of Specialty Hospitals: A Study of the Profitability of General Short-Term Acute Care Hospitals"*, published in the Winter 2008 edition of the *Journal of Health Care Finance*, and defended it at a poster presentation at Academy Health in Chicago.